

CHARTER OF ETHICS OF THE FACULTIES OF MEDICINE

Conférence Internationale des Doyens et représentants des Facultés de Médecine d'Expression Française (CIDMEF)

The Charter of Ethics of the Faculties of Medicine applies in two areas:

- Institutional ethics (in its research and education activities)
- Initial and continuing education in medical ethics

The Charter of Ethics of the Faculties of Medicine is the expression of a moral commitment between the Faculties of Medicine. In this regard, the heads of Faculties of Medicine and Faculties of Health Sciences members of the CIDMEF can count on the solidarity and support of the Conference and other member Faculties.

The Charter is evaluated, spelled out, and improved periodically to assure its relevance.

I. PREAMBLE

All the Faculties of Medicine base their entire activities on values that foster respect for the dignity of the person and solidarity. These universal values govern the relations between the stakeholders in the health-care system: patients, physicians, teachers, researchers, and students. They require that each Faculty upholds its commitments to the students that it trains, to the teachers and researchers that ensure its functioning, and to its affiliated institutions. The Faculty's responsibility to society requires that the institution optimizes the quality of its training and research programs.

Each Faculty of Medicine shall comply with the legislation and regulations in effect in its national community. When its activities are not subject to legal consolidation or if this consolidation is not adequately explicit, the Faculty must look to the recommendations of national or international ethics committees. In any event, the Faculties of Medicine base their activities on respecting human rights.

II. MISSIONS OF FACULTIES OF MEDICINE

Each Faculty defines its own institutional objectives: they are adapted to society to respond to the health-care needs of the population and the individuals that comprise it.

The goal of teaching in a Faculty of Medicine is to train responsible physicians, that is, scientists who are attentive to and serve a population and who are capable of providing individual and collective health care to the people who put themselves in their care or are entrusted to them by society. With this end in view, each Faculty shall strive to reconcile responses to individual health-care needs and the requirements of fair distribution of the health-care resources available. Accordingly, initial and continuing training in medical ethics figures prominently among the Faculty's educational priorities.

The goal of conducting research in a Faculty of Medicine is to develop knowledge for the immediate or potential benefit to individual patients and/or a collective benefit that takes into account the impact on the environment, individuals, and society.

In delivering its services, each Faculty of Medicine works in partnership with the other

stakeholders in the health-care system. The objective is to ensure the highest level of health care for the entire population while maintaining a spirit of fairness and ensuring optimal use of the available means.

The principles underlying the missions of and delivery of services by Faculties of Medicine make it clear that the purpose of medical training and research cannot be primarily lucrative in nature.

These principles also imply that Faculties of Medicine shall assess their activities.

III. RESOURCE PERSONS SUPPORTING FACULTIES OF MEDICINE IN TEACHING AND RESEARCH

The criteria for selecting resource persons shall be based on professional skills specific to each function while respecting institutional objectives and the goals of medical education as defined by the Faculty. The recruitment and promotion of resource persons in the areas of teaching, research, and technical/administrative support by the Faculty of Medicine shall be based on criteria and according to fair and transparent methods, without discrimination on the basis of race, sex, age, socioeconomic status, political affiliation, or religion.

All teachers, researchers, and technical/administrative support staff must accept the principle of monitoring and ethics assessment by a third party in the performance of all their duties.

IV. ETHICS RELATED TO THE TRAINING OF MEDICAL STUDENTS

Concerning medical students:

Admissions to and selection while studying at the Faculty of Medicine shall be based on criteria and according to fair methods, without discrimination on the basis of race, sex, age, socioeconomic status, political affiliation, or religion. The only criteria used shall be congruent with the objectives inherent in the medical training as defined and in accordance with the capacities of the individual student.

The Faculty of Medicine shall be responsible for ensuring that all students in their initial training and all practitioners engaged in continuing education have fair access to learning means in compliance with Faculty objectives and while optimizing the means at its disposal.

Concerning the involvement of patients in medical training:

The initial and continuing education of physicians and other health-care professionals is a process of acquiring professional skills. This training requires practice. Therefore, physicians and other health-care professionals need patients to take part in their training. Patients can be invited to the Faculty; they may be called upon during their stay in the university hospital or in other hospital or extra-hospital facilities.

Therefore, in making agreements binding health-care institutions, the Faculties of Medicine shall provide for procedures that ensure that the dignity of the ill is respected and that their consent for teaching involvement is obtained.

Concerning the organization of education and rotations:

Each Faculty of Medicine must promote, for itself and with its partner institutions,

recommendations and procedures that target ethical quality in education and rotations in accordance with the goal of medical training. It must guarantee the ethical quality of the training for which it is directly responsible.

Concerning the knowledge taught:

Each Faculty of Medicine is responsible for the ethical dimension of the use of the knowledge taught in its programs of study. This knowledge is not necessarily neutral with respect to what they imply: in all regards, they must respect human dignity.

V. RESEARCH ETHICS IN THE FACULTY OF MEDICINE

Each Faculty of Medicine shall found its university research on the principles of humanism and scientific quality.

Concerning students taking part in research:

Students serving as resource persons for research shall receive the same consideration as other research personnel, both with respect to general working conditions and the selection and assessment criteria.

Concerning research laboratories belonging to Faculties of Medicine:

Research themes and methods shall be selected according to the greatest beneficial impacts for the research subjects and the general population. Such choices shall not justify the loss of professional independence of researchers or the Faculty of Medicine itself. These choices imply the respect of human dignity.

The analysis and disclosure of research findings shall ensure the protection of the individuals concerned in accordance with the principle of medical confidentiality.

Through their research activities, researchers affiliated with the Faculty contribute to their own renown as well as that of both the laboratory and institution themselves, while respecting other researchers.

Concerning patients taking part in research:

In conducting their research, physicians and other health-care professionals sometimes require the involvement of patients. In their agreements binding patients and care facilities, the Faculties of Medicine shall provide for procedures that ensure the respect of the dignity and independence of patients taking part in the research, while taking into account the principles of beneficence. Human dignity shall also be respected when healthy individuals take part in the research. Strict ethical rules shall be applied to donations of cadavers, organs, and human products from post-mortems for research or teaching purposes. In all cases, these rules shall respect the wishes of the donors and the legislation in effect in the particular country.

Concerning the use and development of knowledge resulting from research:

The Faculties of Medicine shall be responsible for the ethical dimension of the knowledge resulting from research carried out under their auspices. The goal of the development of knowledge through research under the auspices of the Faculties of Medicine is to develop knowledge for the immediate or potential benefit to individual patients and/or a collective benefit that takes into account the

impact on the environment, individuals, and society.

The knowledge developed through research is not necessarily neutral; rather it entails ethical considerations that the Faculties of Medicine require their investigators to gauge. The use of such knowledge cannot be considered ethical unless it complies with certain criteria, principally the respect of human dignity.

Any potential benefits and impacts must benefit all research stakeholders, but first and foremost the concerned patients.

All researchers, including students, shall benefit from the resultant scientific impacts proportional to their active participation in the work, provided that doing so is not prejudicial to their professional independence, whether related to providing care, conducting research, or teaching. The faculties must ensure that the intellectual property rights of the researchers, including any students involved, are respected.

VI. ETHICS OF COOPERATION BETWEEN FACULTIES OF MEDICINE

Cooperation in the areas of teaching and research shall be implemented between institutions from countries exhibiting different levels of development. In such cooperation agreements, each Faculty of Medicine shall recognize the same values centered on human dignity, apply the same criteria centered on the principle of justice, and respect the same commitments to transparency and responsibility as in national or regional agreements.

VII. TEACHING OF MEDICAL ETHICS

Each Faculty of Medicine shall have a specific training program for medical professionalism that shall include initial and continuing education in medical ethics.

Appendix 1

COMMITTEE FOR THE CHARTER OF ETHICS OF THE FACULTIES OF MEDICINE

Coordinator

- Professor J.H. BARRIER, Chair, CIDMEF Conseil Pédagogique, Nantes (France)

Secretary

- Professor L. BRAZEAU-LAMONTAGNE, Full Professor of Radiology; President, Association des Professeures et Professeurs de la Faculté de Médecine (APPFMUS), Université de Sherbrooke

Contributors

- Professor Mario ALVAREZ, Dean of the Faculty of Medicine of the Etat de Port au Prince (Haiti)
- Professor Nourredine BACHIR-BOUIADJRA, Dean, Faculty of Medicine of Oran (Algeria)
- Professor Geneviève BARRIER-JACOB, Former member of the Comité Consultatif National d'Éthique de France (national advisory committee on ethics) (Paris, France)
- Professor Abdelmajid BELMAHI, Former Dean of the Faculty of Medicine of Rabat (Morocco); former Minister of Health; President of CIDMEF
- Professor Abdelatif BENMATI, Dean of the Faculty of Medicine of Constantine (Algeria)
- Dr. Charles BOELEN, International consultant on health staffing and systems; Former coordinator of the WHO program for human resources in the health sector (Genève, Switzerland)
- Professor André BONNIN, Université Médicale Virtuelle Francophone (virtual medical university) (Paris, France)
- Professor Bernard CHARPENTIER, President, Conférence des Doyens des Facultés de Médecine Françaises (French conference of deans of faculties of medicine); First Vice President, CIDMEF (Paris, France)
- Professor Raymond COLIN, Former Vice Dean for Education, Faculty of Medicine of Rouen (France)
- Professor Luc COTÉ, Full Professor of Family Medicine and Director of the Centre de Développement Pédagogique (center for teaching development, Faculty of Medicine, Université Laval (Quebec, Canada)
- Professor Gérard DABOUIS, Department of Medical Oncology and Palliative Care, CHU de Nantes (France)
- Professor Michel DETILLEUX, National Executive Committee, Ordre des Médecins de France (order of French physicians) (Paris, France)
- Professor Somian F. EHUA, Surgeon, Head, Teaching unit, Faculty of Medicine of Abidjan (Ivory Coast)
- Professor Sahloul A. ESSOUSSI, Former Dean, Faculty of Medicine of Sousse (Tunisia)
- Professor Stone FARAH, Former Dean, Faculty of Medicine, St. Joseph's University (Beirut, Lebanon); past President, CIDMEF
- Professor J.P. FRANCKE, Secretary General of the Conférence des Doyens des Facultés de Médecine de France; Dean of the Faculty of Medicine of Lille (France)
- Professor Jacques FRENETTE, General Practitioner; Vice Dean, Faculty of Medicine, Université Laval (Quebec, Canada)

- Professor Abdelaziz GHACHEM, Former Dean of the Faculty of Medicine of Tunis (Tunisia)
- Professor Bernard GAY, Past President, Collège National des Généralistes Enseignants de France (national college of teaching general practitioners) (Bordeaux, France)
- Professor Roger GIL, Dean of the Faculty of Medicine of Poitiers (France)
- Professor André GOUAZÉ, Founding President and Executive Director of CIDMEF (Tours, France)
- Professor Roger GUILLEMIN, Nobel Prize recipient in Medicine, San Diego La Jolla (United States)
- Professor Claude HURIET, Honorary Senator, UNESCO International Bioethics Committee, Nancy (France)
- Professor François JACOB, Nobel Prize recipient in Medicine (Paris, France)
- Professor François LEMAIRE, Resuscitator, President of the Fondation Maurice Rabin (Paris, France)
- Professor Guy LLORCA, Professor of Therapeutics, Chair of the Ethics Committee of the C.H.U. de Lyon (France) and member of the Observatoire National d'Éthique Clinique (national observatory of clinical ethics)
- Professor Hubert MARCOUX, Chair of the Departmental Committee for Teaching Ethics in Family Medicine, Faculty of Medicine of Université Laval (Quebec, Canada)
- Professor Badie A MEHADJI, Dean of the Faculty of Medicine and Pharmacy of Marrakech (Morocco)
- Professor Petru MIRCEA, CIDMEF Chargé de Mission; Former Dean of the Faculty of Medicine of Cluj-Napoca (Romania)
- Professor Didier MOULIN, Former Dean of the Faculty of Medicine of Université Catholique de Louvain (Belgium)
- Professor Koffi G. N'DAKENA, Head of the Radiology Department of CHU Tokoin-Campus; Dean of the Faculté Mixte de Médecine et de Pharmacie (combined faculty of medicine and pharmacy) of Université de Lomé (Togo)
- Dr. Jacques NDEMANGA KAMOUNE, Urologist, Former Dean of the Faculté des Sciences de la Santé (faculty of health sciences) (Bangui, Central African Republic)
- Professor Moïse OLIVEIRA, Former Rector of Université de Libreville (Gabon)
- Professor Rambré M. OUIMINGA, Former Secretary General of CAMES; Member of the Conseil National d'Éthique (national ethics board)(Ouagadougou, Burkina Faso)
- Professor Hélène PELLET, Former Dean of the Faculty of Medicine Lyon Grange-Blanche (France)
- Professor Pierre POTVIN, Former Dean of the Faculty of Medicine of Université Laval (Quebec, Canada); Chair of the CIDMEF Conseil d'Évaluation (assessment board)
- Professor Pascal RAKOTOBÉ, Rector of Université d'Antananarivo (Madagascar)
- Professor Jacques ROLAND, Former President of the Conférence Française des Doyens des Facultés de Médecine; Member of the Conseil National de l'Ordre des Médecins (national council of the order of physicians) (Nancy, France)
- Professor Jean-Claude ROLLAND, Former Dean of the Faculty of Medicine of Tours, (France); CIDMEF Deputy Director General
- Professor Jean-Jacques ROMBOUTS, Dean of the Faculté de Médecine of Université Catholique de Louvain (Belgium)
- Professor Marcel ROOZE, Former Dean of the Faculté de Médecine of Université Libre de Bruxelles (Belgium)

- Professor Didier SICARD, Chair of the Conseil Consultatif National d'Éthique de France (French national advisory council of ethics) (Paris, France)
- Professor Moussa TRAORÉ, President of the Conférence Africaine des Doyens des Facultés de Médecine d'Expression Française (African council of deans of French-speaking faculties of medicine (CADMEF) (Bamako, Mali)
- Mr. Jean-Philippe SZYLOWICZ, Engineer, Former teacher at the Ecole Supérieure d'Electricité (high school of electricity) (Paris, France)
- Professor Nawar TEWFIK, Faculty of Medicine of Université de Sherbrooke (Canada)
- Professor Mauritius SOSSO, Former Vice-Rector of Université de Yaoundé (Cameroon)
- Professor Dominica VANPEE, Université Catholique de Louvain (Belgium)
- Professor TÔN THẬT BACH, Former Dean of the Faculty of Medicine; Former Rector of the University (Hanoi, Viet Nam)
- Mr. Gilbert VICENTE, Secretary General of the Faculty of Medicine of Strasbourg (France), AUFEMO President
- Professor Patrick VINAY, Former Dean of the Faculty of Medicine of Montreal (Canada), Former CIDMEF President

Appendix 2

METHOD FOR DRAFTING THE CHARTER

The decision to draft a Charter of Ethics of the Faculties of Medicine was made during meetings of the CIDMEF Permanent Office and plenary session in Tours in May 2001 after hearing the report from a workshop facilitated by J. BARRIER (Nantes, France), A. GHACHEM (Tunis, Tunisia), and M. OLIVEIRA (Libreville, Gabon), and comprised of N. BACHIR-BOUIADJRA (Oran, Algeria), A. BELMAHI (Rabat, Morocco), P. CHEDID (Beirut, Lebanon), L. DEGAIL (INSERM Paris, France), J.F. DENEFF (Louvain, Belgium), J. FOURCADE (Montpellier, France), A. MAAOUNI (Fès, Morocco), B.A. MEHADJI (Marrakech, Morocco), D. Mill (Louvain, Belgium), J. N'DEMANGA KAMOUNE (Bangui, Central African Republic), P. N'DUMBE (Yaoundé, Cameroon), and D. THIAM (Dakar, Senegal).

A committee was then established (see above list) and worked for 18 months using an electronic discussion group to exchange information. Each new proposal was integrated into the text and submitted for general discussion. The working group was coordinated by J. BARRIER (Nantes); L. BRAZEAU-LAMONTAGNE (Sherbrooke) served as secretary.

The committee's initial proposals were reviewed by CIDMEF (plenary session in Phnom Penh in February 2003) following a workshop in which the following persons took part:

- Professor J.H. BARRIER (Nantes, France), Charter Coordinator and workshop facilitator; and Professor A. BENMATI, Dean of the Faculty of Medicine of Constantine, Algeria, Recording Secretary.

The Deans or their representatives:

- F.F. ANGWAFO (Yaoundé, Cameroon)
 - A. CUCU (Brasov, Romania)
 - J.L. DEBRU (Grenoble, France)
 - Y. DJANHAN (Bouaké, Ivory Coast)
 - I. GEORGESCU (Craiova, Romania)
 - R. GIL (Poitiers, France)
 - V. GLIGA (Tirgu Mures, Romania)
 - B.A. MEHADJI (Marrakech, Morocco)
 - N. MIU (Cjuij-Napoca, Romania)
 - S.A. OULD MOGUEYA (Nouakchott, Mauritania)
 - G.K. N'DAKENA (Lome, Togo)
 - J. NDEMANGA-KAMOUNE (Bangui, Central African Republic)
 - A. NYAKAYIRO (Butaré, Rwanda)
 - J.J. ROMBOUS (Louvain, Belgium)
 - D. THIAM (Dakar, Senegal)
 - THOUVISOUK BOUNSAI (Vientiane, Laos)
 - TÔN THẬT BACH (Hanoi, Viet Nam)
-
- Other participants: R.M. OUMINGA (Ouagadougou, Burkina Faso), Permanent Advisor to CIDMEF and Former Secretary-General of CAMES; C. BINET (Tours, France), Chargé de

Mission Technologies éducatives CIDMEF and G. VICENTE (Strasbourg, France), AUFEMO President.

The committee resumed discussions for a few months. Interim proposals were tabled by J. Barrier during a plenary session during the XVth Journées Universitaires Francophones de Pédagogie Médicale in Nancy (April 22-25, 2003). The issue of teaching ethics was closely examined by the French-speaking teaching community on a number of levels:

- The findings of the CIDMEF Conseil Pédagogique (educational board) on teaching ethics in French-speaking faculties of medicine were reported on by G. LLORCA.
- A training workshop (L. BRAZEAU-LAMONTAGNE and J.H. BARRIER) on learning ethical reasoning (learning the ethics approach ethics or how to acquire ethical skills?).
- A strategic workshop for faculty representatives on implementing a training program on the professionalization of future physicians (from ethics to the doctor-patient relationship) brought together about 100 participants (experts: J.H. BARRIER, L. BRAZEAU-LAMONTAGNE, and G. LLORCA).
- An open communications session made it possible to exchange experiences from about 20 faculties of medicine from the French-speaking world (e.g. Strasbourg, Dijon, Nantes, Angers, Lille, Brest, Louvain, Montréal, Beirut, etc.).

The committee used the following 12 months to finalize the Charter for validation by the CIDMEF Permanent Office in Bordeaux on May 14 and 15, 2004. The Permanent Office requested that the Charter be assessed and implemented throughout the member faculties and that it be reviewed periodically during CIDMEF plenary sessions. The charter shall be translated for distribution to the non-French-speaking university community.

Appendix 3

DOCUMENTS AND REFERENCES USED BY THE CHARTER COMMITTEE

- Hippocratic Oath
- Universal Declaration of Human Rights
- International Convention on the Rights of the Child. General Assembly resolution 44/25 adopted on November 20, 1989.
- Universal Declaration on the Human Genome and Human Rights. Adopted at the 29th session of UNESCO's General Conference on November 11, 1997.
- Déclaration des Droits de l'Homme et du Citoyen, S. Rials, Ed. Hachette, Paris, 1988.
- World Medical Association
 - o Declaration of Geneva approved by the World Medical Association:
 - o Declaration of Helsinki
 - o 51st General Assembly of the World Medical Association (October 1999) resolution that the teaching of medical ethics and human rights be included as obligatory courses in the curricula of medical schools.

- World Health Organization (WHO):
 - o Developing protocols for change in medical education. Ch. Boelen, J. Des Marchais, C.W. Dohner, and M.P. Kantrowitz, WHO, 1992 1.
 - o Doctors for Health: A WHO global strategy for changing medical education and medical practice for health for all. World Health Organization, Geneva, Switzerland; 1996. (ref. WHO / HRH /96.1).
 - o Defining and measuring the social accountability of medical schools. Ch. Boelen, J. Heck J. World Health Organization, Geneva, Switzerland; 2000 (ref.: WHO / HRH / 95.7).
 - o Universities and the health of the disadvantaged. Ed. D.S. Blumenthal and Ch. Boelen, WHO, 2000
 - o Rapport des Journées d'Etudes Internationales de l'OMS et de la CIDMEF "la Faculté de Médecine et le médecin praticien du XXIème siècle," Brussels, April 9-12, 1996, I. Pelc and L. Cassiers, Université Catholique de Louvain, Université Libre de Bruxelles, Fondation pour l'Etude et la Prévention des Maladies de Civilisation, Ed. Labor Bruxelles, 1998

- Project of the ABIM Foundation, ACP-ASIM Foundation, and European Federation of Internal Medicine, medical professionalism in the new millennium: a physician charter. Ann Intern Med, 2002; 136: 243-246 French translation in Pédagogie Médicale 2004, No. 1.
- Université Laval (Quebec, Canada):
 - o Déclaration des droits des étudiants et des étudiantes
 - o Règlement sur le harcèlement sexuel

- Nuremberg Code
- Comité Consultatif National d'Éthique de France pour les sciences de la vie et de la Santé : La coopération dans le domaine de la Recherche Biomédicale entre équipes françaises et équipes de pays en voie de développement N°41 (December 18, 1993). Actualisation dans l'avis n° 78 " Inégalités d'accès aux soins et dans la participation à la recherche à l'échelle mondiale - progrès éthiques " September 18, 2003.

- Déclaration d'Abidjan (conférence des ministres de l'enseignement supérieur et de la recherche des états et gouvernements ayant le français en partage), AUPELF-UREF, Abidjan, December 1993.
- Ethique et professions de santé. Rapport au ministre de la santé, de la famille et des personnes handicapées. A Cordier, Paris, May 2003.
- La dignité de l'Homme. Actes du Colloque de la Sorbonne, Paris, November 1992. Ed. P. Magnard, Paris Champion, 1995.
- De la dignité humaine. T. de Koninck, Ed. PUF, Paris 1995.
- Professionnalisme et délibération éthique. G.A. Legault, Ed. Presses de l'Université du Québec, 1999.